

**THE MINUTES OF THE 744TH STATED MEETING OF THE
PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

**FRIDAY, 9 AUGUST 2024, 9:00 A.M.
REMOTE MEETING ON ZOOM
ROBERT THOMAS, CHAIR**

CALL TO ORDER

START TIME IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:00:00

Mr. Thomas, the Chair, called the meeting to order at 9:03 a.m. and announced the presence of a quorum. The following Commissioners joined him:

Commissioner	Present	Absent	Comment
Robert Thomas, AIA, Chair (Architectural Historian)	X		
Kimberly Washington, Esq., Vice Chair (Community Development Corporation)		X	
Kareema Abu Saab (Commerce Department)		X	
Donna Carney (Philadelphia City Planning Commission)			
Emily Cooperman, Ph.D., Committee on Historic Designation Chair (Historian)	X		
Zachary Frankel (Real Estate Developer)		X	
Thomas Holloman (City Council)	X		
John P. Lech (Department of Licenses & Inspections)	X		
Dan McCoubrey, AIA, LEED AP BD+C, Architectural Committee Chair (Architect)	X		
Stephanie Michel (Community Organization)		X	
Kyle O'Connor (Department of Public Property)	X		
Franz Rabauer	X		
Matthew Treat (Department of Planning and Development)	X		

The meeting was held remotely via Zoom video and audio-conferencing software.

The following staff members were present:

- Jonathan Farnham, Executive Director
- Kim Chantry, Historic Preservation Planner III
- Shannon Garrison, Historic Preservation Planner III
- Kristin Hankins, Historic Preservation Planner I
- Heather Hendrickson, Historic Preservation Planner II
- Izzy Korostoff, Community Initiatives Specialist
- Ted Maust, Historic Preservation Planner II
- Allyson Mehley, Historic Preservation Planner III
- Leonard Reuter, Esq., Law Department
- Dan Shachar-Krasnoff, Historic Preservation Planner II
- Alex Till, Historic Preservation Planner II

The following persons attended the online meeting:

- Allison Weiss, SoLo Germantown
- Abbey Lewis

Amy Lambert
David Fecteau, Philadelphia City Planning Commission
David Traub, Save Our Sites
Deborah Gary, Society to Preserve Philadelphia African American Assets
Evonne Tisdale
Hanna Stark, Preservation Alliance of Greater Philadelphia
Jay Farrell
Jim Duffin
John Weckerly
Kevin McMahon
Kimberly Haas, Hidden City Philadelphia
Matthew Havens
Michael Mattioni, Esq., Mattioni Ltd.
Michael Phillips, Esq., Klehr Harrison
Nancy Pontone
Oscar Beisert, Keeping Society
Pamela Bracey
Paul Steinke, Preservation Alliance of Greater Philadelphia
Rosalind McKelvey
Steven Peitzman
Suzanna Barucco

DRAFT

ADOPTION OF MINUTES, 743RD STATED MEETING, 12 JULY 2024

START TIME IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:13:12

DISCUSSION:

- Mr. Thomas asked the Commissioners, staff, and members of the public if they had any suggested additions or corrections to the minutes of the preceding meeting of the Historical Commission, the 743rd Stated Meeting, held 12 July 2024. No comments were offered.

ACTION: Mr. Thomas moved to adopt the minutes of the 743rd Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission, held 12 July 2024. Mr. McCoubrey seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: Adoption of the Minutes of the 743rd Stated Meeting of the PHC					
MOTION: Adopt minutes					
MOVED BY: Thomas					
SECONDED BY: McCoubrey					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair					X
Abu Saab (Commerce)					X
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Frankel					X
Holloman (City Council)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel					X
O'Connor (DPP)	X				
Rabauer	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	9				4

REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

ADDRESS: 1330-36 CHESTNUT ST

Name of Resource: F.W. Woolworth Co. Store

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: Treeco/Manor Limited Partnership

Nominator: Historical Commission staff

Staff Contact: Dan Shachar-Krasnoff, daniel.shachar-krasnoff@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the Woolworth Building, 1330-36 Chestnut Street, and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the Woolworth Store, built in 1949, satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, D, and H. Under Criterion A, the nomination argues that the purpose-built Woolworth Store was part of a comprehensive effort by the company to develop large flagship stores in downtowns across the United States and Canada. Under Criteria C and D, the nomination argues that the store's

design is based in the Modernist, International Style, with some references to the Art Deco/Streamline Moderne styles. Under Criterion H the nomination maintains that the Woolworth Store’s horizontality, minimal aesthetic, and stark white color sets it apart from surrounding structures making it a distinctive feature in Center City generally and the 1300 block of Chestnut Street in particular. The period of significance spans from 1949 when the building was constructed, to 1960 when the character-defining original WOOLWORTH sign was replaced.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the property at 1330-36 Chestnut Street, the Woolworth Store, satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, D, and H.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1330-36 Chestnut Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, D, and H.

ACTION: See below

START TIME IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:13:41

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Farnham presented the continuance request to the Historical Commission.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- None.

ACTION: Mr. Thomas moved to continue the review of 1330-36 Chestnut Street to the November 2024 meeting of the Historical Commission. Ms. Cooperman seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: Continuance					
MOTION: Approve continuance					
MOVED BY: Thomas					
SECONDED BY: Cooperman					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair					X
Abu Saab (Commerce)					X
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Frankel					X
Holloman (City Council)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel					X
O'Connor (DPP)	X				
Rabauer	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	9				4

REPORT OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE, 23 JULY 2024

AGENDA

ADDRESS: 1108 S FRONT ST

Proposal: Legalize addition and roof deck

Review Requested: Final Approval

Owner: Lauren Revak

Applicant: William Klotz, Restoration Development Group

History: 1800

Individual Designation: 3/30/1965

District Designation: None

Staff Contact: Ted Maust, theodore.maust@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This application seeks to legalize a rear addition built between December 2023 and March 2024, at 1108 S. Front Street without the Historical Commission's review. The Historical Commission did approve interior demolition and make-safe permit applications in August and December 2023, respectively, but those permits did not cover the new construction. When a Historical Commission staff visited the site, they saw that the unpermitted addition was under construction despite a Stop Work Order issued by the Department of Licenses and Inspections on 9 February 2024. This project was previously reviewed by the Historical Commission at its May 2024 meeting, where the legalization request was denied.

In response to their revised submission for the July 2024 meeting, the Architectural Committee directed the staff to oversee the restoration of front elevation features but voted to recommend denial of the legalization of addition and roof deck. The applicants are now proposing removal of the roof deck and pilot house and asking the Commission to legalize the rear addition as constructed.

SCOPE OF WORK:

- Remove pilot house; legalize rear addition, roof deck, and work to front façade.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines include:

- *Standard 9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*
 - The rear addition is very large in comparison to the historic structure. Removing the pilot house is an improvement, but the roof deck is still very visible from the public right-of-way and changes the established spatial relationships of the property.
 - A two-story addition with a roof deck on the rear ell rather than the main block may be able to satisfy this Standard.
- *Standard 10: New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*
 - From the submitted floor plans, it appears that at least some of the existing rear walls were demolished without the Historical Commission's approval.

ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: The Architectural Committee voted to recommend denial, pursuant to Standard 9.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:14:42

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Maust presented the application to the Historical Commission.
- No one represented the application.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- None.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The rear addition is very large and out of scale with the historic building.
- The cladding of the rear addition is inappropriate, given that surrounding buildings are of masonry construction.
- Proposals for the removal of the roof deck and restoration of the front facade would improve the application.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The application fails to satisfy Standard 9 as it is incompatible in scale and material with the historic resource.

ACTION: Mr. McCoubrey moved to deny the application, pursuant to Standard 9. Mr. Lech seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 1108 S Front St					
MOTION: Denial					
MOVED BY: McCoubrey					
SECONDED BY: Lech					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair					X
Abu Saab (Commerce)					X
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Frankel					X
Holloman (City Council)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel					X
O'Connor (DPP)	X				
Rabauer	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	9				4

ADDRESS: 2012 SPRUCE ST

Proposal: Construct addition and decks

Review Requested: Review In Concept

Owner: Acacia Holding Partners LLC

Applicant: Michael Phillips, Klehr Harrison

History: 1860

Individual Designation: None

District Designation: Rittenhouse-Fitler Historic District, Contributing, 2/8/1995

Staff Contact: Alex Till, alexander.till@phila.gov

BACKGROUND:

This application proposes to construct an addition on the rear portion of the fourth story of a Second Empire rowhouse at a contributing property in the Rittenhouse-Fitler Historic District. It also proposes to construct a large roof deck along with a pilot house and elevator shaft and a smaller rear first-story deck. The building was constructed c. 1860 and is four stories tall with a prominent mansard roof, brownstone façade, and three-story rear ell that faces Cypress Street. The proposed addition will be located behind the main block of the building on top of the current three-story rear ell and will occupy its entire footprint. The main roof deck will be set eight feet back from the roof edge and extend from in front of the peak of the roof to the rear edge of the new addition. It will feature a pilot house set near the front portion and an elevator shaft in the middle. The smaller rear deck will be set at the rear of the building off of the first floor and will be located behind an existing wall and roll-up gate at the rear of the property. The addition and roof deck will be visible from Cypress Street, but that street serves as an alley for access to the rears of surrounding houses and none of them front on the street.

SCOPE OF WORK:

- Construct a fourth-story rear addition
- Construct a roof deck with pilot house and elevator shaft
- Construct a rear deck

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines include:

- *Standard 9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*
 - The proposed addition satisfies Standard 9. It will be differentiated from historic portions of the house and is compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the historic property.
 - The proposed rear deck satisfies Standard 9. It will be differentiated from historic portions of the house and is compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the historic property.
 - The proposed roof deck does not satisfy Standard 9. It is too extensive and covers part of the roof of the historic main block of the house including its peak.
 - The proposed pilot house does not meet Standard 9. It is set too far forward, is too large, blocky, and undecorated and is not compatible with the size, scale, and architectural features of the property.
- *Roofs Guideline | Recommended: Designing rooftop additions, elevator or stair towers, decks or terraces, dormers, or skylights when required by a new or continuing use so that*

they are inconspicuous and minimally visible on the site and from the public right-of-way and do not damage or obscure character-defining historic features.

- The proposed roof deck and pilot house are located on the main block of the house and cover the historic peak of the roof, obscuring and potentially damaging character defining features of the building. This work does not satisfy the Roofs Guideline.

ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: The Architectural Committee voted to recommend approval in concept, provided nothing is constructed on the main block and the addition on the rear ell is designed as a mansard and reduced in height, pursuant to Standard 9 and the Roofs Guideline.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:23:33

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Till presented the application to the Historical Commission.
- Attorney Michael Phillips and architect John Weckerly represented the application.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Paul Steinke of the Preservation Alliance for Greater Philadelphia offered no comments on this application but thanked Mr. Mattioni for his service on the Historical Commission.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The revised application positively addresses the comments of the Architectural Committee. It reduces the size of the deck and removes it from the main block of the house, reduces the size and visual impact of the pilot house, and treats the addition appear more like a mansard.
- The addition will still be very visible from Cypress Street.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The proposed addition satisfies Standard 9. It will be differentiated from historic portions of the house and is compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the historic property.
- The proposed rear deck satisfies Standard 9. It will be differentiated from historic portions of the house and is compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the historic property
- The proposed roof deck and pilot house satisfy Standard 9 with their removal from the main block of the house to the rear ell.
- The proposed roof deck and pilot house satisfy the Roofs Guidelines.

ACTION: Mr. McCoubrey moved to approve the revised application in concept, pursuant to Standard 9 and the Roofs Guideline. Ms. Carney seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 2012 Spruce St					
MOTION: Approval in concept					
MOVED BY: McCoubrey					
SECONDED BY: Carney					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair					X
Abu Saab (Commerce)					X
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Frankel					X
Holloman (City Council)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel					X
O'Connor (DPP)	X				
Rabauer	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	9				4

REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION, 17 JULY 2024

ADDRESS: 106 E SHARPNACK ST

Name of Resource: Douglas Political Club, Hattie Hill Huckabee House

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: Douglas Political Club

Nominator: East Mount Airy Neighbors

Staff Contact: Ted Maust, theodore.maust@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 106 E. Sharpnack Street and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The building on the property consists of a main volume constructed in the 1850s and a rear addition constructed after 1942. The nomination contends that the building satisfies Criteria for Designation A and J. The nomination argues that, as one of the oldest buildings standing on E Sharpnack Street, the property represents the early development and heritage of East Mount Airy. The nomination further contends that the property, in its association with the life of Hattie Huckabee and its use by the Douglas Political Club, represents the political, social, and historical heritage of the African American community in Mount Airy.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 106 E Sharpnack Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A and J, and to revise the period of significance to end in 1942 when the Douglas Political Club moved into the property.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:34:10

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Maust presented the nomination to the Historical Commission.

- Oscar Beisert represented the nomination.
- No one represented the property owner. Mr. Farnham noted that both notice letters had been returned to the Historical Commission as undeliverable. He explained that he then hand-delivered copies of the notice letters with copies of the returned envelopes to the property, placing them in the mailbox on the building.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Evonne Tisdale spoke in favor of the nomination.
- Jim Duffin spoke in favor of the nomination.
- Allison Weiss of SoLo Germantown spoke in favor of the nomination.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The front and rear additions, which post-date 1942, should not be considered historic in form, but may incorporate historic fabric.
- Restoration of the front porch to its 1942 appearance would be appropriate, taking care to preserve any material of the porch roof which remains from that era.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The property is worthy of designation under Criterion A as representative of the early development of East Mount Airy.
- Furthermore, the property's association with the life of Hattie Hill Huckabee and the Douglas Political Club make it worthy of designation under Criterion J.

ACTION: Mr. Lech moved to find that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 106 E. Sharpnack satisfies Criteria for Designation A and J and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places, with the period of significance be amended to end in 1942. Mr. McCoubrey seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 106 E Sharpnack St					
MOTION: Designate; Criteria A and J					
MOVED BY: Lech					
SECONDED BY: McCoubrey					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair					X
Abu Saab (Commerce)					X
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Frankel					X
Holloman (City Council)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel					X
O'Connor (DPP)	X				
Rabauer	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	9				4

ADDRESS: 5209-13 GERMANTOWN AVE

Name of Resource: St. Stephen's Methodist Episcopal Church

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: St. Stephens Church of Germantown

Nominator: Keeping Society of Philadelphia

Staff Contact: Ted Maust, theodore.maust@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes designating the property at 5209-13 Germantown Avenue and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Two buildings sit on the property: a three-story parsonage fronting on Germantown Avenue and a church set further back in the lot. The Historical Commission designated the parsonage in 1957. This nomination seeks to designate the church building and associated burial ground. The nomination contends that the church building and burial ground satisfy Criteria for Designation A, I, and J, as well as Criteria C and/or D. The nomination argues that the property exemplifies the cultural, economic, and social heritage of the community as a place of worship and social gathering, satisfying Criteria A and J. Citing the burial ground, the nomination further contends that the property satisfies Criterion I because it is likely to yield archaeological information about the area's history or prehistory. The nomination form indicates that the property satisfies Criterion C as "Reflect[ing] the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style," but the nomination cites Criterion D. The discrepancy should be corrected during the review.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 5209-13 Germantown Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, I, and J.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:46:52

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Maust presented the nomination to the Historical Commission.
- Jim Duffin represented the nomination.
- No one represented the property owner.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Paul Steinke of the Preservation Alliance of Greater Philadelphia spoke in favor of the nomination.
- Allison Weiss, SoLo Germantown, spoke in favor of the nomination.
- Amy Lambert spoke in favor of the nomination.
- Pamela Bracey, SoLo Germantown, spoke in favor of the nomination.
- Steven Peitzman, East Falls Historical Society, spoke in favor of the nomination.
- Rosalind McKelvey, Wakefield 49ers, spoke in favor of the nomination.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The property owner did not participate in the Historical Commission's review, even though the owner objected to a designation at the Committee on Historic Designation meeting.
- The property owner was provided with sufficient notice of the meeting dates, times, and locations.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The former burial ground and the expanse of undeveloped land may contain archaeological resources and warrant designation under Criterion I.
- The building “reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style,” satisfying Criterion C.
- The property’s legacy as a place of religious and community gathering makes it worthy of designation under Criteria A and J.

ACTION: Ms. Cooperman moved to find that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 5209-13 Germantown Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, I, and J, and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Ms. Carney seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 5209-13 Germantown Ave					
MOTION: Designate; Criteria A, C, I, and J					
MOVED BY: Cooperman					
SECONDED BY: Carney					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair					X
Abu Saab (Commerce)					X
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Frankel					X
Holloman (City Council)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel					X
O'Connor (DPP)	X				
Rabauer	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	9				4

ADDRESS: 1517-19 PARRISH ST

Name of Resource: Engine 13 Firehouse
 Proposed Action: Designation
 Property Owner: Marion Ryder
 Nominator: Preservation Alliance for Greater Philadelphia
 Staff Contact: Allyson Mehley, allyson.mehley@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at Engine 13 Firehouse and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination states that the property, known as “Engine 13 Firehouse,” satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E. The firehouse was constructed in 1901 as part of a major campaign by the Philadelphia Fire Department to modernize and rebuild the city’s fire stations after the turn of the twentieth century. The nomination argues that the property satisfies Criteria C and D as it exemplifies the Beaux Arts architectural influences seen throughout American cities in this era. It further contends that the property satisfies Criterion E, as it was designed by architect Philip H. Johnson, one of the most prominent and prolific designers of public buildings in Philadelphia during this period. The

proposed period of significance is from the time of construction in 1901 through 1951 when Engine 13 relocated from 1517-19 Parrish Street to a new firehouse.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1517-19 Parrish Street satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 01:05:41

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Mehley presented the nomination to the Historical Commission.
- Hannah Stark of the Preservation Alliance represented the nomination.
- Jerome Donovan represented the property owner.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- David Traub spoke in support of the nomination.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The nomination successfully argues for the designation of the building.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The nomination demonstrates that the property satisfies Criteria C and D as it exemplifies the Beaux Arts architectural influences seen throughout American cities in this era.
- The nomination demonstrates that the property satisfies Criterion E, as it was designed by architect Philip H. Johnson, one of the most prominent and prolific designers of public buildings in Philadelphia during this period.

ACTION: Ms. Cooperman moved to find that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1517-19 Parrish Street satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E, and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Ms. Carney seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 1517-19 Parrish St					
MOTION: Designate; Criteria C, D, and E					
MOVED BY: Cooperman					
SECONDED BY: Carney					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair					X
Abu Saab (Commerce)					X
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Frankel					X
Holloman (City Council)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel					X
O'Connor (DPP)	X				
Rabauer	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	9				4

ADDRESS: 1600-10 N 15TH ST

Name of Resource: Siegmund Lubin House at 1608 N. 15th Street

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: Beech LLC

Nominator: Preservation Alliance for Greater Philadelphia

Staff Contact: Alex Till, alexander.till@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 1608 N. 15th Street and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. A semi-detached, three-story, brick rowhouse with a prominent Italianate cornice stands on the property. It was the home of Siegmund Lubin and from 1897 to 1899, served as his primary workplace and studio. The nomination contends that the property satisfies Criterion for Designation A for its association with Mr. Lubin, an important early motion-picture pioneer, who grew to become an international icon in filmmaking, equipment manufacturing, and exhibition. In addition, the property was the primary location for some of Lubin's earliest filmmaking experiments.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1608 N. 15th St satisfies Criterion for Designation A with a period of significance of 1897-1899.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 01:21:10

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Till presented the nomination to the Historical Commission.
- Hanna Stark of the Preservation Alliance represented the nomination.
- No one represented the property owner.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Jim Duffin commented in support of the nomination and on Philadelphia’s role in film history.
- Steven Peitzman commented in support of the nomination and additionally pointed out that the house appears to be in good condition.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The property at 1608 N. 15th St was the home and studio of Siegmund Lubin from 1897-1899.
- The house located at 1608 N. 15th St is now part of a larger parcel numbered 1600-10 N. 15th St.
- Siegmund Lubin was an important early motion-picture pioneer, who grew to become an international icon in filmmaking, equipment manufacturing, and exhibition.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The property at 1608 N. 15th St satisfies Criterion for Designation A for its association with the life and work of Siegmund Lubin

ACTION: Ms. Cooperman moved to find that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1608 N. 15th Street satisfies Criterion for Designation A and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Mr. McCoubrey seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 1608 N 15th Street					
MOTION: Designate; Criterion A					
MOVED BY: Cooperman					
SECONDED BY: McCoubrey					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair					X
Abu Saab (Commerce)					X
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Frankel					X
Holloman (City Council)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel					X
O'Connor (DPP)	X				
Rabauer	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	9				4

ADJOURNMENT

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 01:30:07

ACTION: At 10:33 a.m., Mr. McCoubrey moved to adjourn. Ms. Cooperman seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: Adjournment					
MOTION: Adjourn					
MOVED BY: McCoubrey					
SECONDED BY: Cooperman					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair					X
Abu Saab (Commerce)					X
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Frankel					X
Holloman (City Council)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel					X
O'Connor (DPP)	X				
Rabauer	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	9				4

PLEASE NOTE:

- Minutes of the Philadelphia Historical Commission and its advisory committees are presented in action format. Additional information is available in the video recording for this meeting. The start time for each agenda item in the recording is noted.
- Application materials and staff overviews are available on the Historical Commission's website, www.phila.gov/historical.

CRITERIA FOR DESIGNATION

§14-1004. Designation.

(1) Criteria for Designation.

A building, complex of buildings, structure, site, object, or district may be designated for preservation if it:

- (a) Has significant character, interest, or value as part of the development, heritage, or cultural characteristics of the City, Commonwealth, or nation or is associated with the life of a person significant in the past;
- (b) Is associated with an event of importance to the history of the City, Commonwealth or Nation;
- (c) Reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style;
- (d) Embodies distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style or engineering specimen;
- (e) Is the work of a designer, architect, landscape architect or designer, or professional

engineer whose work has significantly influenced the historical, architectural, economic, social, or cultural development of the City, Commonwealth, or nation;

(f) Contains elements of design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship that represent a significant innovation;

(g) Is part of or related to a square, park, or other distinctive area that should be preserved according to a historic, cultural, or architectural motif;

(h) Owing to its unique location or singular physical characteristic, represents an established and familiar visual feature of the neighborhood, community, or City;

(i) Has yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in pre-history or history; or

(j) Exemplifies the cultural, political, economic, social, or historical heritage of the community.

DRAFT