Public comment received for the nomination of 4740 Baltimore Avenue

Kim Chantry

From: Katherine Dowdell < kdowdell@farragutstreet.com>

Sent: Thursday, April 11, 2024 3:31 PM

To: preservation

Cc: Amy Lambert; Paul Steinke; Hanna Stark **Subject:** Calvary Church 4740 Baltimore Avenue

External Email Notice. This email comes from outside of City government. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender.

I am writing to express my strong support for the designation of Calvary United Methodist Church at 4740 Baltimore Avenue. This important neighborhood landmark is both architecturally and historically significant; it deserves the highest level of protection available.

Thank you - Kathy Dowdell

My name is Richard Kirk. I am speaking only for myself, but full disclosure, I am a Trustee of Calvary United Methodist Church since 1994, and am the retiring Board President for the Calvary Center for Culture and Community, which I led to found and incorporate in 2000 for the sole purpose of preserving and repurposing the Calvary building which was at that time nearly in ruin and up for sale, with its stained glass being sold separately. I have notified everyone of my upcoming retirement next month after 30 years of working on saving this Calvary building. Also I have been a member of the University City Historical Society for 35 years, and my house in the neighborhood was featured in their historic house tours three different years.

After 52 years as a resident of this community, and after 41 years working to restore my own Victorian home in the neighborhood, as a community activist working to reinvigorate and revitalize the surrounding community for all those 40 years, and to the point here, working for 30 years to save the Calvary building and its treasures without any proper qualifications whatever and not being a billionaire, I don't have to defend my position about my support for historic preservation to anyone.

The Calvary Center was successful in filling the Calvary building with religious congregations, educational facilities, social justice groups, the performing arts, community groups, and much more, all non-profit groups, which has had a tremendous halo effect in development in the surrounding area, and has built community, succeeding beyond all expectations for over two decades. But over the past five years the CCCC was hit with a series of calamities which has left the Center in a financial crisis and its survival is in serious question.

It started in the winter of 2018-2019 with a catastrophic failure of the antiquated heating system, which for many reasons took us 6 years and \$350K to finally rectify. After the second heating failure the following winter, the pandemic set in which forced closure of the building for a year and a half, during which we collected almost no income and some of our nonprofit building user groups ceased to exist, and all of this caused the necessity of starting over with our plans to create a new governance for the center and the building, and has left us

hanging on by a thread and completely broke.

These simultaneous blows have used up all of our reserves, and all of our energy, too many of our building users evaporated or left, and have put Calvary Center into a real financial crisis, and it has become very difficult to see the way forward.

The University City Historical Society, through whose auspices I came to Calvary in the first place in 1994, was crucial in our ability to turn around what was at that time considered to be our community's cataclysmic lost cause at Calvary. The UCHS itself established their offices at Calvary as a symbol of their regard for the historic legacy and strategic importance of the Calvary building in revitalizing the surrounding corridor and preserving the astonishing but barely surviving Victorian physical plant surrounding Calvary. But over the years the Society greatly lowered its support of Calvary, as Calvary on the surface seemed to now be succeeding on its own, and in later years it contributed less, and less and then nothing to the effort. In 2022, their representative on the CCCC Board resigned and was not replaced, and then in 2023, the Society actually removed its offices from the Calvary building. The UCHS is well aware, or should be well aware of our financial situation and complete inability to comply with historic designation regulations, either financially or with adequate staff, and they knew that Calvary church was opposed to the nomination for those valid reasons, and yet refused to withdraw their nomination. Just before they submitted this nomination, I had asked UCHS for financial support in helping us finish raising the last \$20,000 of the \$210,000 needed to complete installations of the new HVAC systems, and they did put an appeal in their December newsletter, but the appeal resulted in only about \$1500 in donations, basically not even a drop in the bucket. We asked again this month for their board to attend a meeting to discuss this issue. Only two of the UCHS board members attended the meeting, and one of them, their board president, announced on leaving the meeting early a flat refusal to withdraw the nomination without even hearing any discussion about why Calvary could not support it. I have found the behavior of the Historical Society Board throughout this process to be incomprehensible, irresponsible, and choosing to ignore the reality on the ground concerning of our situation because they have to know what it is. One more comment about the approach taken by the UCHS board president,

Amy Lambert. She was raised in the Methodist church which she says was a very positive experience, she is an architect who really appreciates historic preservation. We desperately need an architect on our board. What if she had approached Calvary offering her services on our board for five or ten years, and agreeing to take on responsibility for helping raise significant finances for restorations, taking on all dealings and interactions with the Commission, that might well have had a very different effect on our decision. Think simple psychology, after all, most people are more convinced by positive offers of real assistance rather than by oppositional empty demands. Shame on her. How much does she really care about this if whe won't put her money where her mouth is? People like her turn my stomach.

Interest and support of Calvary from the community at large seems to have waned in the same direction as UCHS over the years, again taking it for granted. But the local Baltimore Avenue businesses who supported us are now themselves struggling, and some failing, after the pandemic, and while increased gentrification has created a neighborhood much more professional and wealthy, the newcomers in general are not as focused on community bonding or historic preservation. The more well healed new influx of residents in University City seem less inclined to notice or care about historic preservation than the previous generation, and what they do to their vintage homes' interiors reflect this trend. This isn't something evil at all, it simply reflects changing values and priorities.

The bottom line is, Calvary is in a situation right now that our lack of financial means is so great that Calvary and the Center have no choice but to consider all options in order to salvage or restore whatever we can, however we can, at this point. To put it bluntly, through no fault of our own, we have found ourselves in a position that is completely untenable to be the stewards to meet the requirements of historic preservation or keep safe its important art treasures. In order to stay alive and operate in the community, rather than sell the whole package and move on, and with my imminent "retirement", the center absolutely must move to professional management in order to rebuild and to keep operations going, but the question hangs in the air as to where the finances for this kind of necessary

operation will come from. We are talking about \$100K annually that we just do not have.

But beyond the program operations and building management, and this is most important, we still need more than three and a half million dollars to restore the building itself into not even mint condition, but a condition that will allow us to operate under conditions that are beyond constant crisis control, so that management can concentrate on rebuilding the center and develop income streams to revitalize this important and still needed vibrant community anchor on Baltimore Avenue and center for the community and for the arts programs that it has become.

As for Calvary Church, its first concern is to its mission which is one of faith, and to build and bond this community, and to help those who need it. It is not that Calvary Church doesn't appreciate historic preservation, it has done that for some thirty years now and will do so as long as it is able, but sadly, the harsh reality is that we can only do what our meager resources will allow us to do. Calvary simply does not know where the money will come from to help us preserve this building or its works of art. We will have to do what we will have to do. Historic designation at this time will change nothing except that it will complicate matters even further and it will NOT help Calvary or the building or promote preservation.

My observations over recent years have led me to some personal introspection about what actually might be best for the giant Tiffany windows in particular. They themselves are in need of care and restoration. Second, we have all become aware of possible threats of violence at Calvary, a prime political target for many reasons, and the Tiffany windows in their positions right on the busy and heavily trafficked street corridors are completely vulnerable to physical attack as much as are the people inside the building. For that and other significant reasons, I wonder whether the windows wouldn't be physically safer, absolutely much better curated and cared for, and certainly more appreciated and admired in another place.

I want to make the situation perfectly clear. It is not the case that the building would be sold, or that the windows would be sold separately, if there were any

way that this could be avoided. Both the building and the windows are a real artistic asset in themselves even in this city that has an embarrassment of architectural and artistic treasures. But the "if" this could be avoided" is a \$3.5 million dollar "if", and we don't have that kind of money and we don't know where that money will come from.

With all of this, how can the UCHS or the Historic Commission justifiably compel Calvary to comply with the regulations of the Historic Commission when you know full well that we simply cannot afford to do that? And how would historic designation be in the best interest of preservation when it could lead in the opposite direction, perhaps even to a horrific scenario of the building becoming abandoned, no sale possible because of the Commission's restrictions on it, and at some point the building burns down or the priceless windows are vandalized or destroyed in a big storm or just collapse? In my mind this is completely antithetical to what this Commission or the University City Historical Society should even stand for. My understanding is that the Historic Commission and the University City Historical Society in forcing this historic designation would in no way imply that UCHS or the Commission would take on any responsibility of finding the means to properly restore the windows and the building to the point that it can serve the community without going from crisis to crisis to crisis. If that is the case, who do they think will take on that responsibility? I humbly suggest that this nomination be withdrawn or denied. Regardless, I believe that Calvary will still do its best to preserve the building, but we must have all our options when preservation is clearly no longer possible, and will do what is best to save what can be saved if it comes to that, but beyond that, Calvary can do no more, and historic designation may ironically be the straw that breaks the camel's back. The Historic Commission must clearly understand what it means that Cslvary cannot guarantee compliance because of our poor financial situation. You can't will preservation into existence without the money to make it happen. This is not our fault, we are not being irresponsible here and that is why I am giving you this reality check. I'll say it again, Calvary does not have the staff OR the funds to comply with historic designation oversight. It simply does not. It can not. Period. With designation YOU BOTH are creating additional problems that you will not solve and that is not acceptable.

You on the Historical Commission should consider yourselves obligated to understand and appreciate the inconvenient truth of Calvary's position of poverty and take it fully into account as you consider this application, which we have no choice but to oppose. The hard reality is, the real question we face is all about money. For all those who would push for historic preservation without rational and realistic consideration, my only question is the question we are all asking with respect to Calvary: Where will the money come from? And if you don't know the answer, well, I'm sorry, but I don't either and I have worked on this problem for 30 years and all of you have not. Perhaps there is a way you can really help here: If any of you exalted people on the Commission know of some gazillionaire out there that will help Calvary, by all means direct that gazillionaire to CCCC without delay. We will be forever grateful and you can get what you say you want for sure. I am personally forever grateful for every building of great beauty of our collective heritage that can be saved. But after 30 years, I have sadly come to realize that wishing doesn't make it so. Empty directives do not make it so. Only money makes it so. Thank you for your time.

Patrick J. Bayer <patrickbayer1220@gmail.com>

Wed 5/22/2024 8:00 PM

To:preservation open open

External Email Notice. This email comes from outside of City government. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender.

I am writing to express my strong support for the nomination of 4740 Baltimore Ave. I live in the neighborhood on Baltimore Avenue, and pass the church daily, admiring the incredible Tiffany windows. The church is an important neighborhood landmark that is both architecturally and historically significant; it deserves the highest level of protection available.

Thank you, Patrick Bayer

Calvary United Methodist Church

Sharon McCullough <sharon@expertevents.com>

Sat 6/1/2024 8:03 AM

To:preservation opened

External Email Notice. This email comes from outside of City government. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender.

Dear Philadelphia Historical Commission,

I am a long-time West Philadelphia resident and am writing to support the nomination for Calvary UMC. This incredible building has been a landmark on Baltimore Avenue for over a century. Its beautiful architecture has housed numerous community organizations for decades, including Curio Theatre which is a great asset to the neighborhood.

The building should be protected so that it always has the ability to incubate community fellowship, resources, and mutual aid. The neighborhood would be lesser if this building were no longer a part of the landscape of West Philadelphia. By supporting this nomination, we are saying that this place matters, for now and into the future.

Thank you for voting to include Calvary United Methodist Church on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places.

Yours truly,

Sharon McCullough



Expert Events
Philadelphia, New York City, Washington, DC
www.expertevents.com

Sharon E. McCullough President (215) 546-9422 Office (215) 694-9315 Cell

Historical Designation of Calvary Church

Roos, David S. <droos@sas.upenn.edu>

Sat 6/1/2024 8:42 AM

To:preservation opreservation@Phila.gov>

Cc:Anurag Sagar <adsagar1@gmail.com>;Roos, David S. <droos@sas.upenn.edu>

External Email Notice. This email comes from outside of City government. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender.

To whom it may concern – I am writing to express my support for the nomination of the Calvary Church at 48th and Baltimore to the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. I have lived in this neighborhood for 35 years, and have regularly participated in events at the Calvary Church, which is an integral part of the community. The idea that this site – with its obvious historical significance and place in the community – might *not* be so designated, permitting pieces of this heritage to be dispersed, is appalling. I hope that you will proceed with the proposed designation, as supported by the vast majority of residents in the area. Sincerely – David S Roos (4604 Osage Ave)

Please nominate Calvary Church at 48th and Baltimore to the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places

Shawn Berven <shmerv@yahoo.com>

Sat 6/1/2024 8:56 AM

To:preservation openpreservation@Phila.gov>

External Email Notice. This email comes from outside of City government. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender.

Dear Philadelphia Historical Commission,

I'm writing to support the nomination for Calvary UMC. This incredible building has been a landmark on Baltimore Avenue for over a century. Its beautiful architecture has housed numerous community organizations for decades.

The building should be protected so that it always has the ability to incubate community fellowship, resources, and mutual aid. The neighborhood would be lesser if this building were no longer a part of the landscape of West Philadelphia. By supporting this nomination, we are saying that this place matters, for now and into the future.

Thank you for voting to include Calvary United Methodist Church on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places.

Historic Designation of Calvary Church

Anurag Sagar <adsagar1@gmail.com>

Sat 6/1/2024 8:59 AM

To:preservation Fo:preservation@Phila.gov>
Cc:Anurag Sagar <adsagar1@gmail.com>

External Email Notice. This email comes from outside of City government. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender.

To whom it may concern – I am writing to express my support for the nomination of the Calvary Church at 48th and Baltimore Avenue to the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. I have lived in this neighborhood for 35 years, and have regularly participated in events at the Calvary Church, which is an integral part of the community. The idea that this site – with its obvious historical significance and place in the community – might *not*

be so designated, permitting pieces of this heritage to be dispersed, is appalling. I hope that you will proceed with the proposed designation, as supported by the vast majority of residents in the area.

Sincerely – Anurag Sagar 4604 Osage Ave)

Support for Calvary United Methodist Church Philadelphia Register of Historic Places Nomination

Jocelyn Scribano <jocelyn.scribano@gmail.com>

Sat 6/1/2024 1:30 PM

To:preservation opened

External Email Notice. This email comes from outside of City government. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender.

Dear Philadelphia Historical Commission,

Thank you for voting to include Calvary United Methodist Church on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places.

We are writing to express unequivocal support for its nomination to the Register, as a fundamental cornerstone to protecting and preserving the history and beauty of Calvary United Methodist Church for current community members, as well as for future generations.

Our neighborhood would be significantly and irrevocably diminished if the Calvary United Methodist Church building were no longer a part of the landscape of West Philadelphia. Including Calvary United Methodist Church on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places is essential to ensuring that this treasured Gothic Revival sacred space, which has benefited from both a \$250,000 preservation grant from the National Fund for Historic Places and a \$500,000 preservation grant from Pennsylvania's Redevelopment Assistance Capital Program, continues to be preserved, in the present, and equally importantly, into the future.

Calvary UMC provides a beautiful and inspiring focal point in Cedar Park, and by supporting this nomination, we are saying that its preservation of the history, architecture and cultural heritage of West Philadelphia is vital for the community.

Thank you again for voting to include Calvary United Methodist Church on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places.

--

Best regards,

Jocelyn and Phil Scribano 804 S 48th Street, Philadelphia, PA

Calvary United Methodist Church

Bruce McCullough <brucewmcc@gmail.com>

Sat 6/1/2024 4:09 PM

To:preservation opened

External Email Notice. This email comes from outside of City government. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender.

Dear Philadelphia Historical Commission,

I am writing to support the nomination for Calvary UMC. This historic building has been a landmark on Baltimore Avenue in the Cedar Park neighborhood for over a century. Building on neighborhood support years ago when its Tiffany windows were in danger of being sold, as the Calvary Center for Culture and Community it has housed numerous religious and community organizations.

I am on the Board of Curio Theatre Company, which is based in the Calvary Center. The theatre company has provided extensive work to improve, restore, and preserve the building, both for our use and to support the building generally.

I live 2½ blocks away and 6 months ago made a personal donation to support the Calvary Center's current fundraising campaign. I would not have done so had I known that there would be opposition to preserving the building.

This building is important to the West Philadelphia community and should be protected. Thank you for voting to include Calvary United Methodist Church on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places.

Bruce McCullough 4815 Springfield Ave. Philadelphia, PA 19143

Calvary UMC

Joan Weiner <tljweiner@yahoo.com>

Sat 6/1/2024 11:33 PM

To:preservation opreservation@Phila.gov>

External Email Notice. This email comes from outside of City government. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender.

Dear Philadelphia Historical Commission,

I have lived in West Philadelphia since 1979. I'm writing to support the nomination for Calvary UMC. This incredible building has been a landmark on Baltimore Avenue for over a century. Its beautiful architecture has housed numerous community organizations for decades.

The building should be protected so that it always has the ability to incubate community fellowship, resources, and mutual aid. The neighborhood would be lesser if this building were no longer a part of the landscape of West Philadelphia. By supporting this nomination, we are saying that this place matters, for now and into the future.

Thank you for voting to include Calvary United Methodist Church on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places.

Yours truly, Joan Weiner

Calvary UMC historic nomination

Linda Chance < lhchance@gmail.com>

Sun 6/2/2024 6:39 PM

To:preservation < preservation@Phila.gov>

External Email Notice. This email comes from outside of City government. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender.

To Our Friends at the Philadelphia Historical Commission,

I'm writing to support the nomination for Calvary United Methodist Church to the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Surely the Register exists to preserve landmarks such as this so that the fabric of the community will not be torn to shreds. It would be extremely distressing to wake up to the inevitable story in the press that locals had failed to protect this beautiful building and its significant features. It happens all the time, but only if we allow it.

Whatever short-term benefit might be reaped by leaving the fate of the building to the marketplace cannot compare to the care and memories of the generations that bequeathed this landmark to us. We should be the stewards of this monument that has watched over Baltimore Avenue for over a century. The original architects, builders, and decorators deserve our repayment of their kindness in creating this important and splendidly integrated piece of our heritage.

Thank you for voting to include Calvary United Methodist Church on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places.

Yours truly, Linda H. Chance 4332 Larchwood Avenue Philadelphia, PA 19104

Calvary Church nomination

Jennifer Loustau < jenloustau 9323@gmail.com>

Mon 6/3/2024 9:10 AM

To:preservation opened

External Email Notice. This email comes from outside of City government. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender.

Philadelphia Historic Commission To Whom It May Concern:

I support the nomination of Calvary Church at 48th and Baltimore to the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The 1905 Gothic Revival landmark is an exuberant ecclesiastical building with extremely large and valuable Tiffany windows. The building has served as a backdrop to generations of Cedar Park lives and civic activities.

For a society to be rich and meaningful to all its citizens, intrinsic values -- such as history and beauty -- must take precedence over extrinsic values. The Historic Commission is the defender of those values.

Jennifer Loustau, member University City Historical Society

Calvary UMC

Tony Lapp <toekneelap@weeplanet.com>

Mon 6/3/2024 4:02 PM

To:preservation < preservation@Phila.gov>

External Email Notice. This email comes from outside of City government. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender.

Dear Philadelphia Historical Commission,

I'm writing to oppose the nomination for Calvary UMC. I live half a block from the building on Beaumont Avenue, and love both the architecture and the community engagement of the United Methodist congregation. I know how hard the congregation has worked to make the building available for use by different community groups at an affordable rate, and I also know that it's a struggle to maintain the building.

It's not a good look for the Commission to force historical designation on the church owners against their will, and seems likely to force them to eventually sell the building. The building needs significant repairs, which would only be made more costly by the designation. And it would essentially be setting up an antagonistic relationship with a community group with a long track record of being a good neighborhood partner.

Please vote no on including Calvary United Methodist Church on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places.

Yours truly,

Tony Lapp 4816 Beaumont Ave

4 June 2024

Dear Philadelphia Historical Commission,

I'm writing to support the nomination for Calvary UMC. This incredible building has been a landmark on Baltimore Avenue for over a century. Its beautiful architecture has housed numerous community organizations for decades.

The building should be protected so that it always has the ability to incubate community fellowship, resources, and mutual aid. The neighborhood would be lesser if this building were no longer a part of the landscape of West Philadelphia. By supporting this nomination, we are saying that this place matters, for now and into the future.

Thank you for voting to include Calvary United Methodist Church on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places.

Sincerely,

Jessica H. Senker, AIA

Resident: 4503 Spruce Street

Amanda Bouwman <amandaeb26@gmail.com>

Wed 6/5/2024 10:32 AM

To:preservation openpreservation@Phila.gov>

External Email Notice. This email comes from outside of City government. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender.

Good morning,

I am writing in support of adding 4740 Baltimore Ave to the Historic places designation.

I am a lifelong resident of Philadelphia and I have attended a congregation that met in this building for most of my life. I live in West Philly, very close to 4740 Baltimore. I love this historic building and feel saddened to think it may not always be there as a part of the 48th & Baltimore landmark. Please designation 4740 Baltimore Ave as a Historic Place so it can remain in our neighborhood. Thank you,

Amanda Bouwman

4824 Larchwood Ave, Philadelphia, PA 19143

Amanda Bouwman <amandaeb26@gmail.com>

Wed 6/5/2024 10:32 AM

To:preservation openpreservation@Phila.gov>

External Email Notice. This email comes from outside of City government. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender.

Good morning,

I am writing in support of adding 4740 Baltimore Ave to the Historic places designation.

I am a lifelong resident of Philadelphia and I have attended a congregation that met in this building for most of my life. I live in West Philly, very close to 4740 Baltimore. I love this historic building and feel saddened to think it may not always be there as a part of the 48th & Baltimore landmark. Please designation 4740 Baltimore Ave as a Historic Place so it can remain in our neighborhood. Thank you,

Amanda Bouwman

4824 Larchwood Ave, Philadelphia, PA 19143

Sudev J Sheth <sjsheth@gmail.com>

Wed 6/5/2024 4:59 PM

To:preservation opened

External Email Notice. This email comes from outside of City government. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender.

Dear Historical Commission,

I am writing to express my strong support for preserving Calvary United Methodist Church, located at 801 S. 48th Street in Philadelphia. This building is a vital part of our neighborhood's cultural, historical, and architectural heritage.

Built in 1907, this Gothic-style church features stunning architectural elements such as a 10-story granite tower, Tiffany windows, scagliola columns, and hand-painted murals. These unique features contribute to the rich character and visual appeal of our community.

Beyond its physical beauty, Calvary United Methodist Church has played a significant role in the cultural and social fabric of our neighborhood. It has served as a gathering place for diverse groups, fostering a sense of inclusivity and community. The church has also been a hub for various community organizations and events, enhancing the vibrancy and engagement of our area.

Preserving this building is crucial for maintaining our neighborhood's sense of place and connection to its past. It serves as a tangible reminder of the history and evolution of our community, and its continued presence contributes to the unique identity of our area.

Furthermore, protecting this historic church has the potential to generate economic benefits for our neighborhood. Well-preserved historic buildings like Calvary United Methodist Church can attract visitors, stimulate local tourism, and enhance property values in the surrounding area.

I strongly urge the Historical Commission to take the necessary measures to ensure that Calvary United Methodist Church receives the protection and support it deserves. By preserving this invaluable piece of our neighborhood's heritage, we can continue to celebrate our shared history and cultural richness for generations to come.

Thank you for considering my request and for your commitment to preserving the historic treasures of our city.

Sincerely, Sudev Sheth 4827 Larchwood Avenue Philadelphia, PA 19143

Valerie Bai <valerie.bai4@gmail.com>

Thu 6/6/2024 11:28 AM

To:preservation preservation@Phila.gov>

External Email Notice. This email comes from outside of City government. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender.

Hello,

I would like to voice my support for the nomination of Calvary Church as a designated historic site. I have enjoyed attending events at this beautiful site and would love to see it cherished and preserved for generations to come!

Sincerely, Valerie Bai